

The Presbyterians: History, Controversies, and Trends

Mark Sidwell, Ph.D.



The William R. Rice Lecture Series

March 18, 2009

William R. Rice Lecture Series

Detroit Baptist Theological Seminary

Allen Park, MI

March 18, 2009

This year's speaker is **Dr. Mark Sidwell**, Professor of History at Bob Jones University in Greenville, SC.

Dr. Sidwell's lecture topic is "**The Presbyterians: History, Controversies, and Trends.**" While a broad foundation will be laid, the majority of his lecture will focus on developments in American Presbyterianism in the 20th Century and current issues.

In addition to his classroom duties, Dr. Sidwell is also a frequent conference speaker and a published author. His book titles include:

- *The Dividing Line: Understanding and Applying Biblical Separation*
- *Faith of Our Fathers: Scenes from Church History*
- *Faith of Our Fathers: Scenes from American Church History*
- *For God and His People: Ulrich Zwingli and the Swiss Reformation*
- *Free Indeed: Heroes of Black Christian History*
- *The Triumph of Truth: A Life of Martin Luther*
- *United States History for Christian Schools*
- *World Studies for Christian Schools*

Presbyterian History: A Syllabus

by Mark Sidwell

© 2009 Mark Sidwell

All rights reserved.

Reproduction prohibited without written permission of the author

Presbyterian History

Table of Acronyms

ARP = Associate Reformed Presbyterian Church

BPC = Bible Presbyterian Church

EPC = Evangelical Presbyterian Church

FPCNA = Free Presbyterian Church of North America

NCC = National Council of Churches

OPC = Orthodox Presbyterian Church

PCCSA = Presbyterian Church in the Confederate States of America

PCUS = Presbyterian Church in the United States (“Southern Presbyterian Church”)

PCUSA = Presbyterian Church in the USA or Presbyterian Church (USA)

RPCES = Reformed Presbyterian Church—Evangelical Synod

RPCNA = Reformed Presbyterian Church of North America

SBC = Southern Baptist Convention

UPCNA = United Presbyterian Church of North America

UPCUSA = United Presbyterian Church in the USA

WCC = World Council of Churches

Foundations

I. Defining Terms

A. Calvinistic

1. Common but narrow term
2. Often applied to soteriology (doctrine of salvation)—the famous “Five Points” summarized as TULIP
 - a. Total Depravity
 - b. Unconditional Election
 - c. Limited Atonement
 - d. Irresistible Grace
 - e. Perseverance of the Saints
3. Five Points result from Synod of Dort (1618-19)
 - a. Result of Arminian Controversy
 - b. Reaction to “five points of Arminianism”
 - c. A Reformed ecumenical council—including English representatives
4. Label sometimes used by those opposed to label “Reformed” (e.g., Calvinistic Dispensationalists, Sovereign Grace Baptists)

B. Reformed

1. Initially applied broadly to Protestants (just as “Lutheran” was)
2. Later narrowed to Zwinglian-Calvinistic party
3. Broad term: German Reformed, Dutch Reformed, French Reformed (Huguenot); “Presbyterian” is basically “English-speaking Reformed”
4. Refers to distinctive doctrine and practice (Covenant theology, regulative principle, and esp. polity): includes more than “Calvinistic”

C. Presbyterian

1. Dominant Reformed churches in Scotland & Ulster and (with Congregationalism) in England and U.S.

2. From Greek word for “elder”: *presbyter*
3. Named for polity—although presbyterianism is polity of most Reformed churches
4. “Bottom up” power structure
 - a. Congregations governed by session (elders)
 - b. Churches governed by presbyteries
 - c. If large enough, presbyteries governed by synods
 - d. Synods governed by general assemblies
 - e. Note that each level has delegated powers and rights, hence a “republican” form of polity
5. All clergy equal—No hierarchy of bishops

II. Pioneers of Presbyterianism

A. John Calvin

1. Some note Ulrich Zwingli as pioneer—credited with seeds of covenant theology in struggle with Anabaptists (e.g., issue of continuity with circumcision in baptism)
2. Pursued a biblical theology: *Institutes of the Christian Religion* (not so much “systematic” as exegetical), commentaries, sermons & lessons
3. Augustinian in emphasis—sovereignty of God, predestination, election
4. Austere worship
 - a. “Regulative principle”: Elements in worship may be only those commanded by Scripture
 - 1) Contrast Luther’s “normative principle,” that one may keep whatever is not forbidden in Scripture
 - 2) “Reformed according to the Word of God” (e.g., exclusive psalmody)
 - b. Zwingli described as preferring “four bare walls and a sermon”: Worship is “spiritual and nonmaterial” (Loetscher)

B. John Knox

1. Embraced Protestantism but captured by French (spent 18 months on a French galley), served in England and especially as a “Marian exile” in Geneva (which he called “the most perfect school of Christ since the days of the apostles”)
2. Worked to reform the episcopal church of Scotland: “Others snipped at the branches of popery; but he strikes at the roots, to destroy the whole.” But he had only 12 years of labor there before death & saw limited success.
3. Turning Point in 1560: Scottish nobility rejects Catholicism and accepts Protestantism
4. First Scots Confession (1560; by Knox & others)
 - a. Did not actually prescribe a polity but sought doctrinal definition
 - b. Eventually superseded by Westminster standards
5. Proposed a *Book of Discipline* for thorough reform, but did not see it enacted
6. Importance of Church discipline (although goes back to Calvin)
 - a. Third mark of true church (or three marks distinguishing from papacy): “Church discipline rightly practiced” (along with the gospel rightly preached and the sacraments rightly administered)
 - b. Owes formulation to Martin Bucer in contest against Anabaptists in Strasburg (see also the Belgic Confession)

- c. Knox attempted to enact in Scotland (First Scots Confession)
 - d. Provides a neglected rationale for the separatist position
 - 1) Some in Reformed circles denigrate separatism, saying it is a peculiar Fundamentalist/Dispensationalist concept: the “ruin of the church” vs. the “Reformed” concept (confession & sacrament, not purity, the marks of the church)
 - 2) Rather, the third mark stresses the necessity of discipline (moral, doctrinal, etc) as characteristic of the church—church discipline a neglected imperative to separation
 - 3) And, really, the gospel rightly preached and the sacraments rightly administered presumes church discipline rightly practiced
- C. Andrew Melville
- 1. After study/teaching in Geneva, came back in 1574 two years after Knox’s death during an attempt to establish a pseudo-episcopacy
 - 2. “Father of Presbyterianism” or “Architect of Scottish Presbyterianism”
 - a. Said to have been great initial defender in Scotland of “*jure divino* Presbyterianism” (Schaff), the idea of presbyterian polity as divinely ordained
 - b. Became a staunch defender of presbyterian polity and moderated General Assembly during adoption of Second Book of Discipline (1578, a revision of Knox’s unenacted First Book of Discipline)—a major step toward establishing presbyterian polity
 - c. Example: Led famous protest that defined “bishop” as simply the pastor of a church and of no higher authority than any other elder
 - 3. Clashed with James VI/I
 - a. Once, for resisting king’s demand for bishops, he was accused of treason
 - b. Perhaps best known for seizing sleeve of the king, calling him “God’s silly vassal” (*silly* meaning “weak” in that era) and saying, “Sir, I must tell you there are two kings and two kingdoms in Scotland. There is King James, the head of this commonwealth, and there is Christ Jesus, the King of the Church, whose subject James the Sixth is, and of whose kingdom he is not a king, nor a lord, not a head, but a member.”
 - c. After James became king of England, he eventually imprisoned Melville in the Tower of London
 - d. Ended his career teaching in France as an exile, but his pattern for the Church of Scotland eventually triumphed

The Westminster Assembly

I. Background

A. Situation in England

- 1. Puritan controversy
 - a. Puritanism: Movement to purify the Church of England of “popish” elements
 - b. Began with Thomas Cartwright (Cambridge) and his admonitions for presbyterian polity—successfully resisted by Elizabeth
- 2. Puritan divisions over polity
 - a. Presbyterian polity dominant among English Puritans (but large minority held to congregational polity)

- b. Congregational polity dominant among New England Puritans (although small minority held to other forms)
 - c. Puritanism does **not** equal Presbyterianism: Puritanism deeply influenced Presbyterianism, but Puritanism was not exclusively Presbyterian.
 - 3. Stuart resistance to Puritan calls for reform
 - a. Although reared in Scotland, James I opposed presbyterianism, which he said “agreeth as well with a monarchy as God and the devil.”
 - 1) Declared “No bishop, no king.” James saw episcopacy as a safeguard to the monarchy—the same “top-down” authority as divine right monarch.
 - 2) On Puritans: “I will make them conform, or else will harry them out of the land.” His son Charles I *did* harry them to New England.
 - b. The Authorized Version (1611) was only Puritan reform he granted.
 - c. Charles I
 - 1) Of high church (some say Catholic) sympathies—pushed bishops for the rule of the church
 - 2) Held to divine right kingship and sought to diminish Parliament
 - B. Situation in Scotland
 - 1. Stuart attempts to enforce episcopacy and the prayer book on Scotland
 - 2. Uniting of Charles’s enemies (Puritans, Scots, Parliament)
 - 3. Initial use of prayer book in Edinburgh sparked a riot and resulted in drawing up the National Covenant (1638), ostensibly loyal to the king but upholding Protestant practice/doctrine. Source of “Covenanters” in Scotland to protect the church & the Reformation; later the Solemn League and Covenant (1643) supposedly committed England to same system
 - C. English Civil War (War of the Three Kingdoms)
 - 1. Contestants: Parliament & Scotland (at first) vs. King Charles I
 - 2. Causes
 - a. Religious: Stuart attempts to enforce conformity and to frustrate Puritan-like reforms
 - b. Political: Attempt to rule (esp. to tax) without Parliament
 - c. Spark: The king’s failed “Bishops’ War” to enforce a prayer book on Scotland—forced Charles I to call Parliament for money
 - 3. Course
 - a. Eventual military victory for Parliament through commanders such as Oliver Cromwell who fashioned “New Model Army” (marked by discipline & religious fervor)
 - b. Westminster Assembly called to forge English-Scottish links and to reform the Church of England
 - 4. Consequences: Charles I executed and Cromwell became Lord Protector—but Scotland ended up opposed to England and loyal to the Stuarts
- ## II. Meeting and Results of the Westminster Assembly
- A. History
 - 1. Called by Parliament July 1643 to plan for church reform for “all his majesty’s domains” (incl. Scotland); supposedly England would follow the Scottish pattern
 - 2. Represented all branches of thought and nation

- a. Episcopalians (though most abstained; debated whether James Ussher attended); Presbyterians (dominant), Scots (also Presbyterians: e.g., Samuel Rutherford); small group of Independents (Congregationalists)
- b. Representatives from each county of England (national comprehension)
- c. New England Puritans were invited but turned it down (feared the potential legal commitment)
- d. One of the most learned Reformed synods in history (comparable to Dort)
- 3. Sessions
 - a. Main meeting place: St. Margaret's Church near the houses of Parliament in Westminster
 - b. 121 official participants, although normally only 60-80 on any given day
 - c. Held 1,163 sessions in assembly and committees; many meetings in the Jerusalem Chamber
- 4. Final session February 1649 (petered out after Scots broke with Parliament)
- B. Work of the Assembly
 - 1. "Westminster Standards"
 - a. Overall name for materials prepared by the assembly
 - b. Known for doctrinal standards but also produced directories for ordination, church government, and worship
 - 2. Westminster Confession
 - a. Largest labor: took 27 months to write (August 1644 to December 1646)
 - b. Proof-texts added later at the request of Parliament
 - c. Theological Significance
 - 1) Most comprehensive Reformed doctrinal statement of the Reformation
 - 2) Greatest summation of Puritan theology—the climax and refining of Reformation theology and **not**, as some critics charge, dry Scholastic rationalism
 - 3) Based on the pattern of the 39 Articles and other English confessions
 - 4) Begins with the Bible, not Theology Proper (Bible-based faith, *sola scriptura*)—Schaff thinks this perhaps the finest article
 - 5) Most original contribution: Sabbath teaching (according to Schaff)
 - 3. Catechisms
 - a. Larger Catechism
 - 1) Fuller version usually more for theological study
 - 2) Intended for public exposition
 - b. Shorter Catechism
 - 1) Originally intended more as a children's catechism
 - 2) Has surpassed the Larger Catechism in popularity and one of the most significant Reformed theological symbols
- C. Heritage of the Assembly
 - 1. Worldwide Presbyterian Standards
 - a. Accepted by the Church of Scotland in 1647
 - b. Standard of Presbyterian churches in North America, although revised, supplemented, and eventually dodged in the PCUSA
 - 2. Challenge: Interpretation—Lengthy fights over "subscription" throughout history (America especially)

3. Other Versions of the Westminster Standards
 - a. Cambridge Platform (1648)—Congregationalist (New England)
 - b. Savoy Confession (1658)—Congregationalist (England)
 - c. Baptist Adaptations
 - 1) London Confession of Faith (1688)
 - a) “Westminster Confession Immersed”
 - b) Called Philadelphia Confession in America
 - c) Embraced by many Reformed-leaning Baptists today
 - 2) Keach’s Catechism: Baptist adaptation of Shorter Catechism

Presbyterian Beginnings in America

I. Background

A. Puritan influence

1. Some Puritans leaned toward presbyterian polity, but they never formed a presbytery
2. Early Presbyterian congregations in NY (notably Long Island) as early as 1640s—first Presbyterian minister Francis Doughty of New England (1642)

B. Scots-Irish Influence from Ulster

1. Although settled by early Stuarts in Ireland to “pacify” the land, the Scottish settlers had a hard time financially as well as with Irish.
2. Many immigrated to America where they had a profound effect.

C. Scottish vs. English

1. Presence of the Scottish Presbyterian tradition and English Puritan tradition created ethnic/cultural tensions
2. Also created theological tensions, notably over differing view of subscription to Westminster standards—Scots more strict.

II. Francis Makemie, Father of American Presbyterianism

A. Background

1. Parents were Covenanters who fled Scotland for Northern Ireland
2. Makemie came to North America (Maryland) at age 25 in 1683 after some mission work in Barbados
3. Sources are thin on his life and career

B. Ministry

1. The Presbyterian equivalent of circuit-riding with his horse Button and his boat *Tabitha*
2. Worked first in Maryland and Virginia and then the rest of Middle Atlantic

C. Work for Religious Liberty

1. Although Baptists made a major contribution to America’s religious liberty, others, such as Makemie, also contributed
2. Won major court cases in Virginia and New York that secured protection of English Act of Toleration for non-Anglicans
3. Important because Presbyterians were not officially recognized—Presbyterianism in America never had official state support

III. Formation of American Presbyterian Church

A. Origins

1. First presbytery, Presbytery of Philadelphia, in North America (1706)

2. Makemie the first moderator—First synod 10 years later
 3. Jedediah Andrews of Philadelphia—first settled Presbyterian minister
- B. Significance
1. Mixture of English and Scottish traditions
 2. American Presbyterianism built from “bottom up” (presbyteries first), giving presbyteries more power than in Scotland (notably over ordination)
- C. Adopting Act (1729)
1. Question: How to ensure that candidates for the ministry were orthodox.
 - a. Scottish: Require express subscription (declared obedience and submission to) Westminster Standards.
 - b. English/Puritan: Fearing ecclesiastical tyranny, desired instead to examine candidates closely on personal views
 2. Details of Adopting Act
 - a. Required “agreement in, and approbation of” of the Standards in “all essential and necessary articles”
 - b. Could “scruple” some matters, notably on role of the state, but has been stretched farther and farther through the years
 - c. Presbyteries approved candidates by ruling on scruples—could be challenged in synod and general assembly
 - 1) Many long battles over what is “essential and necessary”
 - 2) **“Loose”** vs. **“Strict”** subscription
- IV. Great Awakening and American Presbyterianism
- A. Overview
1. Beginnings of the awakening with Theodore Frelinghuysen (same year as Adopting Act)
 - a. Dutch Reformed minister of German extraction (accepted call to “Raritan,” not knowing it was in NJ)
 - b. Pietist influence—especially a living faith (experimental religion)
 2. Jonathan Edwards and New England—theology of revival, preaching (“Sinners in the Hands of an Angry God”), evangelism & missions (David Brainerd among Indians)
 3. George Whitefield (1740-42)—unites the revivals across the colonies
 4. South—Whitefield (scattered), Samuel Davies (Virginia) and Whitefield’s converts, Baptists Shubal Stearns and Daniel Marshall in Sandy Creek, NC (south of modern Greensboro)
- B. Tennent Family—Middle colonies (biggest area of Presbyterian contribution)
1. William Tennent (an Ulsterman) moved to Bucks County, Pa., and eventually founded Log College to educate sons & others (part of heritage of Princeton)
 2. Gilbert Tennent
 - a. Influenced by Frelinghuysen, began itinerant preaching in 1730s
 - b. Preached without respect to “parish boundaries” (a controversial practice) which local ministers saw as a rebuke
 - c. Opposition => Tennent preached “Danger of an Unconverted Ministry”
 - 1) Controversial sermon—declared many opponents unconverted and called on members to flee such churches

- 2) Perhaps not entirely fair—not all opponents were unconverted but were concerned about defiance of church authorities
- 3) Tennent did later apologize for going too far
- C. Old Side-New Side Split
 - 1. In 1741, the Presbyterians split into the “Old Side” and pro-revival “New Side” when the Old Side forced out New Side presbyteries
 - 2. Issues
 - a. Itinerancy
 - 1) Old Side wanted church order upheld as fitting to the church of God—bring charges before presbytery, don’t simply denounce
 - 2) New Side focused on reaching unregenerate by all means (urgency)
 - b. Theological education: The Old Side opposed “log colleges” for university education (historic Presbyterian stress on an educated ministry)
 - c. Ordination
 - 1) Old Side wanted stricter subscription
 - 2) New Side wanted a testimony of personal conversion (Old Side tended to presume conversion of those raised in church with catechism, sacraments, and regular preaching of Word)
 - 3. Many see the Puritan-Scotsman division in New Side-Old Side (but note that Tennents were of Ulster extraction)
 - 4. Reunion—The two sides reunited in 1758
 - a. New Side had grown to triple the size of Old Side (relatively equal before)
 - b. Terms addressed Old Side concerns about subscription and legitimate authority of the church
 - c. However, the terms of union approved of the Great Awakening and demanded “experimental acquaintance” with the gospel
 - 5. Interpretations
 - a. Hart & Muether treat the resolution of union as unfortunate, making American Presbyterianism an unstable mixture of “pietism” and confessionalism (reliance on regular church ministry of Word and sacrament)
 - b. On the other hand one can stress necessary evangelical element—the experience with Christ which rote and routine endanger; draw on *both* Old Side and New Side heritage (order & examination; spiritual life)

Scottish Presbyterianism 1660 to the Present

I. Political Situation

A. Background

- 1. Ulster plantation—under the early Stuarts, the attempt to pacify Ireland by settling Scottish Presbyterians in Northern Ireland
- 2. Restoration of Stuarts (1660) under Charles II

B. Covenanter Struggle

- 1. Stuarts did not keep faith and began to interfere with the Scottish church
- 2. Great Ejection (1662)—all ministers who would not submit to episcopacy
- 3. Covenanter Resistance
 - a. Professed adherence to National Covenant to defend the church (continuing theme with many groups)

- b. Open air meetings with pastors who refused submission to bishops
 - c. Even armed rebellion by Covenanters, although unsuccessful
 - d. After death of Charles II, Covenanters opposed James, Duke of York (James II/VII), a Catholic
 - e. “Killing time” (1680-88), killing of many Covenanters—became time of violence, a kind of guerilla warfare
4. Glorious Revolution (1689)
- a. Accession of William and Mary brings an end to persecution
 - b. 1690: Final establishment of Presbyterian Church in Scotland and Westminster Standards
 - c. Ongoing Problem: Lay patronage—lay landowners (i.e., landlords) presenting candidates for pulpits and often forcing them in (i.e., through General Assembly) over protests of congregation and presbytery
 - d. Many Covenanters rejected William and Mary as “un-covenanted” monarchs
- II. Eighteenth Century (1700s)
- A. Parties
1. Moderates
 - a. Accepted settlement of 1690 as satisfactory despite lay patronage; cooperated with government (after 1707—union with England)
 - b. Pattern of “Latitudinarian” (reason a source of religious authority with Scripture and tradition)—fruit of rationalistic Enlightenment
 - c. Strengthened by nominalism of majority of the comprehensive church
 - d. Accepted in principle subscription to Westminster Confession (hence “moderate) but many (though not all) were liberal: e.g., Unitarian (Arian)
 2. Evangelicals
 - a. A sizeable minority remained committed to orthodoxy & true religion
 - b. Strengthened by George Whitefield’s 14 visits; notable revivals, such as the Cambuslang Awakening
 - c. Characteristic: “Communion seasons” for the Lord’s Supper—with weekend-long celebrations, tokens for participants as a “fence” (protection), forerunner of American camp meetings
- B. Secessions
1. Cameronians
 - a. Named from Richard Cameron, from Covenanter period
 - b. Some remnants formed Reformed Presbyterian Church (small in Scotland & Ireland) and RPCNA (“Covenanter Synod”) in U.S. (seminary in Pittsburgh, Geneva College, upbringing of Clarence Macartney)
 - c. Affirm National Covenant (King William was an “un-covenanted” king; RPCNA would not participate in politics)
 2. Secession Church
 - a. Ebenezer and Ralph Erskine
 - 1) Marrow Controversy: Sparked when Thomas Boston republished *The Marrow of Divinity*, stressing the free offer of the gospel (supposedly balanced legalism and antinomianism); Erskine one of those who protested its condemnation

- 2) Rejected lay patronage
- 3) Resistance to liberalizing tendencies among Moderates
- b. Character
 - 1) Note “Secession,” not a separate church, but saw itself as a continuation of the true church
 - 2) Initially close to Whitefield in his work, but broke when Whitefield continued to work with established Church of Scotland
 - 3) Famous member: John Brown of Haddington (*Self-Interpreting Bible*)
 - 4) Later descendants: United Secession Church (1820) & Original Secession Church (1842)
- c. American Branches
 - 1) United Presbyterian Church of North America (1858-1958), northern and western branches, merged with PCUSA
 - 2) In the South, gave rise to Associate Reformed Presbytery Church (ARP)
- 3. Relief Church (Presbytery)
 - a. Formed in 1761 under leadership of Thomas Gillespie over lay patronage
 - b. Later merged with much of Erskines’ followers in United Presbyterian Church
- 4. Robert and James Haldane
 - a. Left Church of Scotland when Moderates nixed foreign missions
 - b. Became Congregationalists, then Baptists (big step for Baptists in Scotland)
 - c. Unlike most secessions were voluntaryist (no coercion in religion; even secessions still thought their views should be enforced by state); marked a beginning of “New Light” emphasis that repudiated state coercion

III. Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries

A. Evangelical Revival

- 1. Fresh surge of evangelical theology/piety after 1800 (Thomas McCrie, Andrew Thomson, Thomas Chalmers) revived in response to rationalistic excesses of French Revolution (seemed to vindicate orthodoxy & Calvinism)
- 2. Example of concern: British and Foreign Bible Society battle over including the Apocrypha in Bibles
- 3. Extreme: Edward Irving, a “proto-Charismatic”

B. The Disruption (1843)

- 1. Major Leader: Thomas Chalmers
 - a. Well-read and talented—actually converted *after* he became a minister in the Church of Scotland
 - b. In Glasgow, he sought to use the parish system in place of state welfare, using funds from the Church of Scotland for church-directed, church-administered relief
 - c. Remained interested in science and mathematics (credited with originating the “Gap Theory”)
 - d. Eventually became a professor in the University of Edinburgh
- 2. Issues in the Disruption
 - a. Theological liberalism, but only secondarily
 - b. Government interference in the Church (esp. lay patronage)
 - 1) 1842, a majority called for no govt. interference in affairs of church

- 2) Parliament rejected this claim
3. Formation of the Free Church of Scotland
 - a. About 1/3 of ministers and members of the Church of Scotland withdrew (Free Church “the church without the steeple”; Church of Scotland “the church without the people”)
 - b. Chalmers moderator and principal of its new college
4. Notable Figures
 - a. Robert Murray McCheyne—not actually in Free Church (d. 1843) but embraced esp. after Andrew Bonar published *Memoirs of McCheyne*
 - b. Alexander Duff—important missionary to India; represented the majority of Church of Scotland missionaries who joined the Free Church
 - c. Andrew and Horatius Bonar (hymn writers; proponents of premillennialism—in contrast to traditional Reformed amillennialism)
- C. Splits and Reunions
 1. 1892—Free Presbyterian Church of Scotland formed
 - a. Left over Declaratory Act of Free Church concerning the interpretation of liberty of conscience/private judgment in light of the Westminster Confession
 - b. Split in 1989 over controversy when one of leading members, a member of the House of Lords, attended the funeral Mass of a Catholic colleague
 2. 1900—United Free Church of Scotland (Free Church and United Presbyterian Church)
 - a. Minority Free Church continued—“Wee Free” Church
 - 1) Believed in establishment (reason it resisted 1900 union)
 - 2) Won recognition in House of Lords as continuing Free Church
 - 3) Stresses Sabbath-keeping (“blue laws”) and exclusive psalmody
 - b. Recently Free Church split over doctrinal/moral questions about Free Church theologian Donald Macleod; the Free Church of Scotland (Continuing) represents about a fifth of church; led by Maurice Roberts
 3. 1921—Parliament guaranteed freedom from state control
 4. 1929—United Free Church reunites with Church of Scotland; a small Free Church branch resists and leaves
- D. Church of Scotland Today
 1. Predominantly liberal with Puritan groups among its ranks (e.g., Forward Movement)
 2. Dropping in numbers—from 1.3 million members in 1956 to 660,000 in 2001; one leader called for closing of 500 of the Church’s 1,700 churches

American Presbyterianism from the Revolution to the Civil War

I. Situation After the Revolution

- A. America’s Leading Presbyterian: John Witherspoon (1723-94)
 1. Scottish clergyman opposed to Moderatism and brought to America
 2. Signed Declaration of Independence
 3. Presidency of College of NJ (Princeton)
 - a. Influenced leaders such as James Madison (e.g., recognition of human depravity in forming Constitution)

- b. Popularized Scottish Common Sense philosophy: one can perceive reality through “common sense” observations because senses are dependable and we all reason from the same principles (evidential apologetics); cf. presuppositionalism which presumes natural depravity and that everyone argues from first principles
- B. Plan of Union (1801)
 - 1. Joint effort of Presbyterians and Congregationalists to evangelize the “west” through cooperative effort
 - 2. Heightened influence of New England Theology among Presbyterians
 - a. New England Theology traces back to Jonathan Edwards but was modified even more by later proponents
 - b. Ideas: governmental theory of atonement (Jonathan Edwards Jr.), questioning of the imputation of Adam’s sin (Samuel Hopkins), sin as voluntary action (Nathaniel Taylor), climax in “Pelagian” extremes of Charles Finney
 - 3. Plan opposed by Old School because (a) lacked Presbyterian control (discipline by presbyteries) and (b) influence of New England Theology
 - 4. Brought some New England Congregationalists (e.g., Lyman Beecher) into Presbyterianism
 - 5. Actually led to most of the new churches in west being Presbyterian (because of superior organization and discipline)
- C. Old School–New School Tension
 - 1. Old School
 - a. Heir of “Scots-Irish” Presbyterianism
 - b. Stress on denominational distinctives
 - c. Strict Westminster theology
 - d. Presbyterian polity (some *de jure*, only divinely allowed form; Thornwell vs. Hodge on this point)
 - e. Generally opposed political activism *in the church* (“spirituality of the church” of the South)
 - f. Opposition to revivalism
 - g. Strong in South with centers in the North
 - 2. New School
 - a. Heir of New England Puritanism
 - b. Stress on interdenominational cooperation
 - c. Openness to other theological traditions—notably New England Theology—and usually looser subscription
 - d. Presbyterian polity—but not too insistent (e.g., Plan of Union)
 - e. Social reform—Christianizing society (abolition, prohibition)
 - f. Support of revivalism
 - g. More dominantly (but not entirely) in the North
 - h. **Note:** Not inherently “liberal” (although some did become so)—will see later examples of the New School as defenders of the faith
 - 3. Examples of Tension
 - a. Plan of Union (New—in favor; Old—opposed)
 - b. Heresy trial of Albert Barnes for governmental view of atonement

- c. Princeton (actually originally considered “middle of the road” in conflicts)
- II. Second Great Awakening
- A. East
 - 1. College Revivals
 - a. Spiritual declension from original founding
 - b. Example: Timothy Dwight at Yale
 - 2. Church Revivals
 - a. Awakening the nominally Christian in “churchly” society
 - b. Example: Asahel Nettleton, Congregationalist (although also working among Presbyterians too)
 - 3. John Chavis in Virginia an example of African American Presbyterian work
 - B. “West” (Old Northwest, Kentucky, Tennessee, etc.)
 - 1. Circuit-riding—basically Methodist, but illustrates religious conditions in the West
 - 2. Camp meetings
 - a. Began with Presbyterian James McGready in Logan County, Ky., in continuation of “sacramental seasons” of Scottish Presbyterianism
 - b. Early Presbyterian involvement, e.g., Cane Ridge Camp Meeting near Lexington, Ky. (1801) hosted by Presbyterian Barton Stone
 - c. Revival growth led to founding of Springfield Presbytery by revivalists
 - 1) Growth precluded usual standards in education & ordination, over the protests of other Presbyterians
 - 2) Eventually dissolved as leaders began to hold non-Presbyterian views; Barton Stone helped found the hyper-Arminian Restoration, or Stone-Campbell, Movement (Churches of Christ)
 - d. Cumberland Presbyterian Church—Began in 1810 after in 1805 the Synod of Kentucky suspended the Cumberland Presbytery over subscription to the Westminster Confession; adopted Arminianized version of Westminster Standards; strongly revivalist and located in Border States
- III. The Civil War Era (1837-69)
- A. Issue of Slavery
 - 1. Not as pronounced as with Baptists and Methodists but a source of tension
 - a. 1845: Baptists split (founding of SBC) & Methodists split (forming of old Methodist Episcopal Church, South, or “Southern Methodist Church”)
 - b. Other groups felt tensions (e.g., Disciples/Churches of Christ); touched the Presbyterians but not the major issue *at first*
 - 1) Many New School (but not all) in North favored abolition movement as an example of interdenominational effort to “Christianize” America
 - 2) Old School opposition to political activism in the church caused many northern Presbyterians to oppose abolition movement & some to argue that the Bible did not touch on the issue
 - c. Henry Clay: “I tell you, this sundering of the religious ties which have bound our people together I consider the greatest source of danger to our country.”
 - 2. Differing Presbyterian Attitudes Toward Slavery
 - a. **John Rankin:** Driven from Dandridge, TN, went eventually to Ripley, OH (on Ohio R.); conductor on Underground Railroad; Old School but thought New School might be more pro-abolition; founded first “Free

Presbyterian Church” in the U.S. in 1847 as an abolitionist body centered in Midwest (notably Ohio) (reabsorbed by degrees 1857-65)

- b. **Charles Colcock Jones:** “Religious instruction movement” for slaves; Georgian Presbyterian (1804-63; see Robert Manson Myers’ *Children of Pride*); student at Princeton Seminary but son of plantation owners; began religious instruction movement; worked in Liberty County, Georgia (near Savannah); held regular meetings for the slaves with preaching & catechizing (wrote a catechism for slaves, which he used for his children) and appointed black “watchmen” over congregations

B. Presbyterian Divisions

1. Division of 1837

- a. Concerned about theological corruption (polity, New Haven Theology), the General Assembly, dominated by the Old School, abrogated the Plan of Union, and expelled four New School synods on doctrinal grounds
- b. Slavery was not an issue *per se* (despite what some writers intimate) but slavery/abolition was an Old/New School point of tension
- c. Two churches (in North) from 1837 to 1869, Old & New School

2. Later Divisions

- a. In 1857 New School split over slavery, with the United Synod of the South becoming a separate body (1857-63)
- b. Old School divided in 1861 over loyalty to the Union (sparked by pro-Union Gardiner Spring Resolutions of 1861), resulting in formation of the Presbyterian Church in the C.S.A.

C. Revivals of the Civil War Era

1. General Observations

- a. Not as dramatic in their impact on Presbyterianism: revivals consciously nondenominational
- b. Not limited geographically to either North or South

2. Prayer Meeting Revivals (1857-58)

- a. Began with Jeremiah Lanphier and Dutch Reformed Church in N.Y.
- b. Lunch hour prayer meetings in cities—“Businessman’s revival”
- c. Often layman-led meetings featuring informal prayer, hymns (“Stand Up, Stand Up for Jesus”), & testimonies
- d. Had an effect on Britain, esp. Ulster—’59 Revival

3. John Girardeau in Charleston

- a. Burdened for black population of the South Carolina Low Country, which he saw as his own unreached mission field
- b. Took over a black mission church in Charleston, what became Zion Church on Calhoun St.; by 1860 had 600 members and 1,500 in Sunday school
- c. Gave close attention to church ministry (divided into “classes”); allowed blacks (incl. slaves) to be lay leaders
- d. 1858: Significant revival that began with a prayer meeting

4. Civil War Revivals

- a. Revivals both north and south; Presbyterians involved, but interdenominationally

- b. Characterized by preaching of chaplains and (in North) by lay evangelists (e.g., Christian Commission with D. L. Moody) but also small groups led by lay soldiers
 - c. Most famous: “Great Revival” in Lee’s Army of Northern Virginia (during “encampments” between campaigns)
 - d. Major figure: Thomas “Stonewall” Jackson, Presbyterian deacon and promoter of religion in the Confederate army
- D. Unions & Reunions
1. The Southern Presbyterian Church
 - a. 1863: The Presbyterian Church in the C.S.A. (Old School) merged with the New School United Synod of the South (and a smaller group) to form the PCCSA
 - b. After the war, this became the Presbyterian Church in the U.S. (PCUS, or “Southern Presbyterian Church”)
 - 1) Predominantly Old School until 20th century
 - 2) Eventually merged with UPCUSA in 1983, thus ending schisms
 - c. Theological Significance
 - 1) Along with Princeton Theology (discussed later), most significant school of conservative theology among American Presbyterians in the 19th century—although influence not as widespread until Calvinist/Puritan revival after World War II
 - 2) Robert Lewis Dabney—great systematic theologian; Union Seminary
 - 3) James Henley Thornwell
 - a) Perhaps greatest mind in Southern Presbyterian theology; sought a comprehensive, united, Westminster theology
 - b) Born in poverty in Marlboro County, SC, in 1812; pastor; professor at and president S.C. College (USC); later Columbia Theological Seminary
 - c) Known for teaching on the church
 - Insistence on *jure divino* presbyterian polity
 - “Spirituality of the church”: Church, as a spiritual body, has a spiritual purpose & should not inject itself into politics (does not preclude *Christian* involvement, only *church* involvement)
 2. North: Old School–New School Reunion (1869)
 - a. Reasons for separation diminished
 - 1) Removal of southern faction weakened Old School party
 - 2) New School, perhaps stung by Old School criticism, became more doctrinally vigilant & strongly Presbyterian (e.g., using denominational mission boards) in orientation
 - 3) Came to a compromise agreement on subscription to Westminster Confession (“pure and simple” adherence)
 - b. Set the stage for a different struggle: Liberalism & orthodoxy from 1870 to 1935

Presbyterianism in Ulster to 1859

I. Early Irish/Celtic History

A. Situation

1. Often appealed to today in “Celtic spirituality” which has little to do with real Irish history
2. Relative isolation of Ireland a factor in early development

B. Birth of the Celtic Church

1. Patrick of Ireland
 - a. Youth in Roman Britain, enslaved to Ireland, who escaped only to return under call of God as missionary
 - b. Only limited information—two writings (*Confession* and *Letter to Coroticus*); in later accounts, Patrick grows more “Catholic”
 - c. Cannot be proved “Catholic” by surviving evidence (e.g., study in Europe & commission by Rome)—but be careful of “Protestants before Protestantism”
 - d. Simpler worship & missions oriented but still a monk (different form of monasticism)
2. Columba & Iona: Scottish island that Columba set up as a center to evangelize Scotland & England

C. Taming of the Irish Church

1. Synod of Whitby (663): Brought English church (Celtic-influenced) into conformity with Roman practice
2. English conquest: Synod of Cashel (1172) brought Celtic church into conformity and under church in England

II. Reformation Era

A. Change in Political Outlook

1. Protestantism heightened English-Irish conflict. (Catholicism became more “patriotic” to Irish.)
2. Ireland was technically Anglican (Church of Ireland)—gives a small minority power, upsetting not only Catholics but also Presbyterians
3. Leading Anglican: James Ussher, Archbishop of Armagh, Puritan in sympathy, composed Irish Articles (1615)

B. Beginnings of Irish Presbyterian Church

1. “Eldest daughter” of Scottish Presbyterian Church
2. Plantation of Ulster: Scots come to Ireland, sent by Stuarts to pacify the island
3. 1661—beginnings of a real, separate Irish Presbyterian Church
4. Battle of the Boyne, July 1, 1690: Defeat of forces of James II by those of William III—hence the “Orange” of Ulster Protestantism
5. Becomes a “national church,” not an official “state church” (although did receive some government subsidies until the 19th century)
6. Significant American immigration from Ulster

III. Ulster Presbyterianism in the 19th Century

A. Henry Cooke and Second Subscription Controversy

1. The first subscription controversy (early 1700s)
 - a. The Irish Presbyterian Church supposedly used the Westminster Confession as the standard for the church
 - b. Some protested against subscription

- c. Solution: One writer said the church *could* have (1) dismissed all non-subscribers or (2) required subscription of all future candidates while non-subscribers died out, but decided to put all non-subscribers into one presbytery (of Antrim), leaving seeds for a second controversy
 - 2. Unitarianism (Arian type) began to infiltrate the Irish Church
 - 3. Henry Cooke, hero of Orthodoxy
 - a. A “seven years’ war” against Unitarianism (1822-28)
 - b. Initially alone in annual synod battles but persevered—went to heart, not just dealing with controversial individuals but examining all candidates
 - c. 1827 pressed to question *all* ministers on Quest. 6 of the Shorter Catechism (“How many persons are there in the Godhead?”)
 - d. 1829: Non-subscribers formed Remonstrant Synod of Ulster
 - e. 1835: Subscription required
 - 4. Scottish secession (Erskines) strong in Ulster
 - a. Main synod of Ulster united with Secession Synod (1840)
 - b. 292 congregations in Synod of Ulster; 141 in Secession Synod at merger
- B. ’59 Revival
- 1. Background
 - a. Some argue the Ulster church was born—had its first breath of life—in the Six Mile Water Revival of 1625 (origin in revival)
 - b. ’59 Revival inspired in part by reports of America’s Prayer Meeting Revivals
 - 2. Traditional Beginning: Prayer meeting held by James McQuilkin in Ballymena: Influenced by the story of George Mueller
 - a. Led to large meeting in Aloghill (threatened the physical structure of the church, so they met in open)
 - b. Moved to Ballymena proper
 - c. Once it reached Belfast, revival spread through Ulster
 - 3. Characteristics
 - a. Prayer meetings (once 5,000 in a quarry)
 - b. Open air meetings (sometimes to accommodate crowds)
 - c. Crowded churches—not only on Sunday but also nightly
 - d. Interdenominational, although Presbyterians dominated
 - e. “Prostrations”: Controversial physical reactions to conviction (cries, collapse) divided even friends of revival (agreed to disagree over the issue)
 - f. Believers’ Meetings—small prayer and Bible study meetings that influenced American Bible conference movement through George Needham (Baptist—leader in formation of Niagara Conference)
 - 4. Revival touched southern Ireland, Scotland, Wales, and England, but strongest in Ulster: Est. (a guess really) of 100,000 converts
 - 5. Created Division
 - a. Called both “Year of Grace” and “Year of Delusion”
 - b. Majority of Presbyterians favored it and were evangelical
 - c. Evangelicals saw a pattern: Cooke’s cleansing from liberalism led to God’s sending of blessing

Presbyterian Controversy in America (1869-1936)

I. Onset of the Controversy

A. Rise of Liberalism

1. Rooted in the rationalism of the Enlightenment and the philosophy of Kant
2. Became a factor in the U.S. only after Civil War (borrowing European scholarship)
3. Often called “Modernism,” because it sought to bring theology into “modern world” and make it appeal to “modern man”
4. Influences
 - a. Hegel—inevitable progress
 - b. Darwin—evolution of simple to complex (e.g., now discredited history of religions approach)
5. Began in colleges, went to seminaries, thence to pulpits, thence to pews
6. Some have argued “openness” of New School allowed liberalism (and Old School was certainly shut to liberalism) but many conservative New School figures fought liberalism too (e.g., James Brookes against C. A. Briggs)
7. **Main Issue: Confessional Church vs. “Broadening Church”** (Loetscher)

B. Orthodox Response

1. Princeton Theology: Confessional Presbyterianism systematized
 - a. History of Princeton
 - 1) Founded in 1812
 - 2) Went from “middle of the road” (in early years, when the middle was less discreditable than later) to staunchly Old School
 - 3) Became the Presbyterian Church’s leading school
 - b. Princeton theologians
 - 1) Archibald Alexander—founder; responded to Deism
 - 2) Charles Hodge
 - a) Leading systematizer in his 3-volume *Systematic Theology*
 - b) Fought German criticism and Darwinism; his book *What Is Darwinism?* said, “It is atheism.”
 - 3) B. B. Warfield
 - a) Led charge in late 19th, early 20th centuries
 - b) Best known in defense of inerrancy (with A.A. Hodge)
 - c. Evaluation
 - 1) Weakness: Underestimated noetic effect of sin (how sin affects our ability to reason)—believed that reason and revelation should coincide independently
 - 2) Staunch in its defense and *explanation*—not *invention*—of inerrancy
 - 3) The leading *scholarly* response to liberalism
2. Dispensationalism
 - a. Many Presbyterian conservatives of late 19th and early 20th centuries adhered to dispensationalism—a neglected factor in Presbyterian history, if subsidiary
 - b. Originally formulated by Plymouth Brethren in early 19th century with a surprisingly widespread influence
 - c. Theological significance

- 1) Not traditionally Reformed: Main point is discontinuity of Israel and the church vs. Covenant Theology's strong continuity
- 2) Very strong on orthodox doctrine: Absolute inerrancy of the Bible, insistence on fundamental truths about Christ
- 3) Example of how the "broadening church" concept was an openness to new ideas, not simply an openness to liberalism
- d. Adherents
 - 1) James Brookes: Major figure in spreading dispensationalism, leader in Niagara Bible Conference, staunch opponent of liberalism
 - 2) Presbyterian evangelists (to various extents): J. Wilbur Chapman, William Biederwolf, Billy Sunday
 - 3) Lewis Sperry Chafer
 - a) Southern Presbyterian & founder of Dallas Theological Seminary
 - b) Theologian of the Fundamentalist movement
 - c) Spread Fundamentalism in South—but usually in interdenominational form (Bible conferences, schools, Bible churches)
 - d) Often felt tension with Reformed theology
- e. Evidence shows that dispensationalists made up a significant portion of Presbyterian militants.
3. Tightening Discipline
 - a. Portland Deliverance (1892): Insisted on inerrancy as the teaching of the church and a requirement for ordination
 - b. Fivefold ordination test (1910; reaffirmed 1916 and 1923)
 - 1) All candidates had to affirm inerrancy, the virgin birth, vicarious atonement, the resurrection, & miracles
 - 2) Not *all* of the fundamentals, but shibboleths being denied by liberalism
 - 3) Leads to myth of "five fundamentals" of Fundamentalism—really a response to liberal attack than a statement of all essentials
 - c. Yet made modification of Westminster Confession to accommodate a merger with the more Arminian Cumberland Presbyterians
4. Heresy Trials
 - a. Not "witch hunts" but due process in a legal manner
 - b. Against professors: Charles Augustus Briggs (convicted over inerrancy), H. P. Smith, & A. C. McGiffert
 - c. Pastors (more rarely): David Swing of Chicago—acquitted by presbytery but became independent rather than endure a prolonged fight
 - d. Trials required preparation, courage, & persistence—and a willingness to endure bad publicity

II. The Fundamentalist-Modernist Controversy

A. Background

1. Series of denominational battles in 1920s and 1930s over control of denominations: Presbyterian & Baptists in the North the biggest
2. Orthodoxy vs. tolerance—idea of a "broadening church" more inclusive of doctrinal differences
3. "Fundamentalism" taken from *The Fundamentals* (1910-15) and a comment by Baptist editor Curtis Lee Lawes

- B. Battles in the Presbyterian Controversy
 - 1. Controversy over Harry Emerson Fosdick
 - a. Fosdick a liberal Baptist in a Presbyterian church—preaches “Shall the Fundamentalists Win?” (1922)
 - b. Clarence Macartney preaches “Shall Unbelief Win?” and launches overture to oust Fosdick
 - c. Fosdick asked to become Presbyterian (and be subject to discipline) or leave a Presbyterian pulpit
 - d. Tolerance defeated—on a technicality
 - 2. Auburn Affirmation
 - a. Group of liberals and tolerant conservatives (1923) ask General Assembly to repeal the fivefold doctrinal test as unconstitutional
 - b. In 1927 the General Assembly agreed and allowed liberty on these issues
 - c. Tolerance proclaimed
 - 3. Princeton Seminary Controversy
 - a. Faction wishes to reorganize board of Princeton Seminary
 - b. Board reorganized (1929) to include all views found in Presbyterian Church
 - c. Machen and conservatives leave to form Westminster Theological Seminary
 - d. Tolerance mandated
 - 4. Missions Controversy
 - a. Conservatives led by Machen protest liberalism among Presbyterian missionaries (e.g., Pearl Buck in China)
 - b. Machen forms Independent Board for Presbyterian Foreign Missions (1933)
 - c. Machen tried for violating church discipline and defrocked (1935)
 - d. Machen founds Orthodox Presbyterian Church (1936)
 - e. Tolerance toward conservatism denied
- C. Differing Conservative Approaches
 - 1. Maintain Cultural Influence
 - a. William Jennings Bryan: Maintain “Christian civilization” (cf. his political activism, the Scopes Trial)
 - 1) Bryan the Christian
 - a) Conversion in a revival as a young man
 - b) As with Lincoln, scriptural and imagery pervaded his speech and writing. From 1904 Democratic Convention: “You may dispute over whether I have fought a good fight; you may dispute over whether I have finished my course; but you cannot deny that I have kept the faith.”
 - c) Lived a consistent Christian testimony
 - d) Saw Bible as basis for civilization but also affirmed “natural goodness of man,” reflecting his own political Populism and perhaps Cumberland Presbyterian background
 - 2) Affirmed Christian activism: “If the Christian men shun politics, how can this be a Christian country?”
 - a) Favored “big govt.” over “big business
 - b) Pressed majority rule & majority will
 - c) Near pacifism (World War I) and opposed imperialism (Christian civilization, but not by force)

- d) Lost a race for vice-moderator of PCUSA in 1923
 - 3) Anti-evolution Crusade & Scopes Trial
 - a) Not just “defending Genesis” (in fact, held to Day-Age theory)
 - b) In part, an expression of his Populism (majority rule)
 - c) Feared effects of Darwinism: Morality & virtue rely on religion, and evolution undercuts them
 - b. Clarence Macartney: Believed cultural visibility important to witness
 - 1) Politically activist, rejecting Southern Presbyterian “spirituality of the church” and supporting prohibition
 - 2) Unwilling to give up on the Presbyterian Church
 - a) Confessional integrity important but followed a “Puritan” approach
 - b) Believed that a majority could be roused for conservative cause
 - c. Billy Sunday
 - 1) Part of a strong urban evangelistic thrust among Presbyterians dating from c. 1900 and initiated by Sunday’s mentor, J. Wilbur Chapman
 - 2) Mild Presbyterianism dedicated to cultural impact through evangelism: “I don’t know any more about theology than a jack-rabbit knows about ping-pong, but I’m on my way to glory.”
 - 3) William T. Ellis: “Billy Sunday never diverged from the Westminster Confession of Faith—although scholarly John Calvin would have been scandalized by his terminology.”
 - 4) Stressed fundamentals, but little on Presbyterian distinctives
 - 5) “I hold fellowship with all who believe in Christ and follow Him as Lord and Master. My particular church is the Presbyterian and I was ordained as a Presbyterian minister. We Presbyterians know what we believe and why.”
 - 6) Emphasis on rallying Christians in general more than any interest in a denominational perspective
- 2. Dispensationalist Option
 - a. Lewis Sperry Chafer: Dispensational theology more important than Reformed theology
 - b. Example: Merrill T. MacPherson
 - 1) Vice president of IBPFM; suspended along with Machen
 - 2) Formed Church of the Open Door of Philadelphia, and joined the Independent Fundamental Churches of America (founded for Bible churches, particularly for Congregationalists)
 - 3) “Typically” Fundamentalist—a break from a mainline denomination to associate with an interdenominational premillennial fellowship
 - 4) Key point is dispensationalist system, not Presbyterian identity
 - 5) Without Presbyterian affiliation, Presbyterian dispensationalists drifted to other moorings
- 3. Confessional Integrity: J. Gresham Machen
 - a. Confessional, not Fundamentalist
 - b. Hesitant about term “Fundamentalist” and later rejected it
 - c. Preferred full Westminster orthodoxy to stress on certain “fundamentals”
 - d. Separatist: Formed purely Presbyterian Orthodox Presbyterian Church

- D. Concluding Thoughts on the Controversy
 - 1. Presbyterian “Fundamentalism” a coalition united only by opposition to liberalism
 - 2. Presbyterian discipline a determining factor—whether for orthodoxy or for tolerance
 - 3. Nature of Presbyterian separatism
 - a. Common Argument: J. N. Darby’s “ruin of the church” as the root of Fundamentalist separatism
 - b. Yet Machen’s approach is separatism of a different kind, based on Reformation’s “third mark” of the true church: “Church discipline rightly practiced.”

Presbyterian Controversy in Ulster (1859-1951)

I. Background of the Controversy

A. Aftermath of the purging of the Unitarians

- 1. Relative doctrinal harmony & orthodoxy after ’59 Revival
- 2. Rise of academic liberalism (from European schools) as opposed to Enlightenment rationalism that was the basis of earlier Unitarianism

B. Forces Shaping Ulster Presbyterianism

- 1. Revivalism—whatever contributes to promotion of revival
 - a. Contributions of Revivalism in Ulster
 - 1) Heritage of the ’59 Revival—Represents to Ulster Christians what the Great Awakenings do to American Christians
 - 2) “Methodistic” piety (what Wesley and Whitefield had in common)
 - a) Experience of a vital relationship with Christ as the central Christian experience
 - b) Spirit-anointed worship and preaching—not “Charismatic” but not simply an assumption of the Spirit’s work through the Word and the sacraments
 - c) A stress on both conversion and holy living
- 2. Confessionalism
 - a. Strong stress on confessional integrity and subscription
 - b. Also a strong influence of the Princeton theology upon Ulster (esp. in the theological school) with stress on confessional identity & a special stress on inerrancy.
- 3. Example of C. H. Spurgeon
 - a. Not Presbyterian but wielding an enormous influence evangelically and beyond
 - b. Downgrade Controversy: Fought growth of liberalism in the Baptist Union, eventually withdrawing—“Fellowship with known and vital error is sin.”
 - c. Unusual precedent of Baptist independence
 - d. Not a significant effect on the Baptist Union but an inspiration to evangelicals in Britain and America (e.g., Thomas Spurgeon, E. J. Poole-Connor)

II. J. E. Davey Heresy Trial

A. Background

- 1. Davey a professor in the Presbyterian theological college in Ulster and a Modernist
- 2. James Hunter of the Irish Presbyterian Church brought charges against him resulting in a major heresy trial

B. Trial

1. Hunter brought charges with the help of student W. J. Grier. Accused Davey on five points: (a) denying imputation (of Adam and Christ), (b) origin of sin, (c) nature of Jesus (esp. deity), (d) nature of the Trinity, and (e) inspiration, infallibility, and authority of Scripture
2. Davey's defense: Liberty within the bounds of interpretation of the Westminster Confession
3. Case weakened when Grier admitted he later added to (but did not falsify) his class notes to make Davey's heresy clearer
4. Davey acquitted by a large margin in General Assembly

C. Results

1. A small faction (including Hunter & Grier) left to form the Irish Evangelical Church
2. Davey eventually served as moderator of the Irish Presbyterian Church.
3. Ronald Wells argues that the Davey heresy trial was to Ulster Fundamentalism what the Scopes trial was in America: a defining moment but also a defeat.

III. W. P. Nicholson Campaigns in Ulster

A. Character of Nicholson

1. Born in Ulster into a godly family, he ran away to sea and was converted only several years later.
2. After theological training in Scotland, worked with the campaigns of J. Wilbur Chapman & later served as a staff evangelist for BIOLA.
 - a. Chapman a "bridge" between D. L. Moody (under whom he began) and Billy Sunday (who was his assistant)
 - b. Used "simultaneous" method to reach more—various outreaches in addition to the main campaign
 - c. Nicholson adopted many of the methods of American evangelists
3. He was a boisterous man with popular manner.

B. Course of Campaigns

1. Two series of campaigns in Ulster from 1920 to 1923 and 1924 to 1926 that moved that province more than anything since the '59 Revival, despite the unrest involved with the partition of Ireland.
2. Thousands of conversions were reported, with the Presbyterian Church reporting from 4,000 to 6,000 new memberships a year from 1920 to 1924. This was in the midst of violence (e.g., hearing gunfire outside).
3. Parallel to Billy Sunday's campaigns in U.S. in 1910s but having a concentrated impact on a smaller geographical area
4. Steve Bruce: "Nicholson was both the voice of orthodoxy against the rising tide of modernism and the instigator of the last great religious revival in Ulster." He is somewhat the opposite of Billy Graham—popularizing the militant side by means of his renown as a preacher.

C. Influence

1. He took a firm stand against liberalism. "Take care what sort of church you join. If the minister denies or doubts the Book or the Blood have no fellowship with him, or you become a partaker with him in his evil deeds."

2. Some claim his Fundamentalism an “import” (American revivalism, premillennialism, Keswick teaching) yet it took root among the Ulster populace.

IV. Founding of the Free Presbyterian Church

A. Background of Ian Paisley

1. Father, I. Kyle Paisley, left the Baptist Union in Ulster in protest over liberalism, as Spurgeon had done.
2. Became pastor of an independent congregation (although founded by a Presbyterian church as a mission), & W. P. Nicholson often attended his services.

B. Occasion of Founding

1. Founded in 1951 when the Irish Presbyterian Church tried to stop one of its congregations from holding an evangelistic campaign with Paisley. The majority of the church withdrew, formed a new church, and asked to join with Paisley’s church, thus forming the Free Presbyterian Church of Ulster
2. Points to notice
 - a. Davey was moderator of Irish Presbyterian Church at the time, underscoring what the protestors saw as the Irish Presbyterian Church’s hostility to orthodoxy.
 - b. Paisley’s motivation: He did not simply represent traditional Ulster anti-Catholicism. Rather he was committed to orthodox Protestantism, a commitment that led him to oppose, first, Protestant liberalism and also Catholic apostasy.
 - c. Fundamentalism *not* a peculiarly American phenomenon (although often viewed so); George Marsden, in a much noted footnote, says that Ulster is the only place outside of the U.S. where Fundamentalism has been a relatively large movement with a discernible impact on society.

C. Later Development

1. Adopted a brief Articles of Faith of the Free Presbyterian Church in addition to the Westminster Standards, mainly stressing essential doctrines and liberty of mode/subjects of baptism and eschatology
2. Slow growth through the 1950s
3. Saw remarkable growth—even revival—after the beginning the “The Troubles” in the 1960s
 - a. Protests and violence arising from Catholic opposition to provincial policies
 - b. Paisley became a leading “Unionist” politician—opposing unification of Ulster with the Republic of Ireland
4. Eventually spread outside Ulster, spawning (among other works) a separate Free Presbyterian Church of North America in 2005
5. Paisley remained moderator of the denomination and pastor of its largest church (Martyrs Memorial Free Presbyterian Church) until his retirement in 2008

Mainline Presbyterianism in America Since the 1930s

I. Definitions

A. What is the “mainline”?

1. Originally a railroad term—churches that go back to colonial America like trains went from major rail center to major rail center

2. Suggests influence & dominance, but in reality lessening in influence (decline since 1960s)
- B. Mainline Presbyterianism
1. Presbyterian Church (USA) PCUSA and denominations that united with it
 2. PCUSA heir of work of Francis Makemie early 1700s and forming of first American presbytery—a “mainline” straight back to this event
- II. The Neo-Orthodox Consensus
- A. Situation in 1930s
1. PCUSA had rejected confessional discipline in 1920s: Where would it go from here?
 2. “Orthodoxy” (in whatever form) became the business of the presbyteries
 3. By informal agreement—but not coercion—the church came to a “Neo-Orthodox Consensus” (Coalter, Mulder, and Weeks) into the 1960s
 4. Embodied by John Mackay, president of Princeton Seminary (1936-59); see his *Presbyterian Way of Life* (1960)
- B. What is Neo-Orthodoxy?
1. Karl Barth
 - a. Launched Neo-Orthodoxy with commentary on Romans after World War I because of the bankruptcy of liberalism
 - b. Of Swiss *Reformed* background: Influenced by Calvinism
 - c. Emerged in America in 1930s, notably with Niebuhr brothers (Reinhold and Richard)
 2. The “orthodox” part
 - a. Rejected liberal optimism—“realistic theology” that admitted sin; liberalism taught “A God without wrath brought men without sin into a kingdom without judgment through the ministrations of a Christ without a cross” (H. Richard Niebuhr)
 - b. Uses orthodox concepts/terminology (transcendence of God, “original sin”)
 - c. Probably some conservatives were seduced into it—or the label at least
 3. The “Neo” part
 - a. Accepted of liberal higher criticism
 - b. Viewed different kinds of “history”: (a) History which is subject to historical criticism and (2) “salvation history” which is a matter of faith—so that something could be false in history & true in salvation history (e.g., believing in “virgin birth” but not parthenogenesis)
 - c. God spoke *through* the Scripture; it is a means of revelation but not a revelation
 - d. Stress on social ethics (e.g., Niebuhr’s influence on M. L. King Jr.)
 4. Even Princeton fell by the 1940s (as orthodox men retired)
- C. Confession of 1967
1. The height of Neo-Orthodox influence in Presbyterian Church
 2. Specifically repudiated the Westminster Confession’s view of Scripture as the Word of God to a belief in Christ as the incarnate Word of God *witnessed* by Scripture
 3. Repudiated confessional authority (even for itself) by saying that all “problems and crises” must judged on an individual basis

4. Failed utterly to provide UPCUSA a basis of unity & identity; Carl McIntire titled his critique of the confession *The Death of a Church*
- D. Upshot
1. Neo-Orthodoxy splintered into other forms of liberal theology: Liberation, Black, Feminist, etc.
 2. Polity (and hierarchical bureaucracy) not doctrine has become the basis of discipline, the “glue,” that holds the PCUSA together
 3. Theologically (and many other ways) a *pluralistic* church—and proud of it
- III. Reunions
- A. Influenced by the rise of the ecumenical movement
1. World Missionary Congress at Edinburgh (1910)
 - a. Birthplace of modern ecumenical movement (although originally supported by many conservatives who saw it as uniting for missions & evangelism)
 - b. Promoted missionary cooperation (e.g., comity agreements)
 - c. Organizations formed that led to WCC—e.g., “Doctrine divides, service unites.”
 2. World Council of Churches (1948)
 3. National Council of Churches (c. 1950, from the Federal Council of Churches of 1908)
 4. Federated (e.g., WCC) vs. Organic (e.g., PCUSA) Union
 5. Prefigured with 1906 merger with Cumberland Presbyterians
- B. Merged with United Presbyterian Church (1958) to form UPCUSA
1. UPCNA (1858-1958) was a union of Scots-Irish in America from Covenanter/Seceder backgrounds. (The modern ARP had stayed out of this merger.)
 2. Conservative on whole but had adopted new confessions in 20th century (1925, 1945) that modified the Westminster Standards
 3. Not necessarily strongly conservative: William Ashbrook of Columbus, OH, underwent severe struggles, and he eventually left to join the IFCA and later helped found the Ohio Bible Fellowship
- C. PCUS (Southern Presbyterian Church)
1. In 1983 merged with UPCUSA to form the modern PCUSA
 2. PCA (1973) was a seceding minority
 3. Southern churches in the PCUSA tend to be a little more conservative than average, but they have been pretty much absorbed and lost distinctiveness
- IV. Controversies
- A. Political Issues
1. 1950s and 1960s: Support of civil rights movement (e.g., Presbyterian leader Eugene Carson Blake, both ecumenist & civil rights activists)
 2. 1970s and 1980s: Women in ministry (eventually approved), reflecting Feminist emphasis (e.g., “Re-imagining God”—not officially PCUSA but paid in part by PCUSA money with PCUSA ministers participating)
 3. Since 1990s: Homosexuality
 4. In all cases, hierarchy/bureaucracy favored liberals while rank & file resisted
- B. Protest movements
1. Presbyterian League of Faith (1920s & 1930s): Led by Macartney and Machen but weakened by division

2. Presbyterian Lay Committee—surprisingly confrontational, but won't leave the church
 3. Confessing Church—recent, more informal movement
 - a. Insists on salvation through Christ alone (rejects pluralism)
 - b. Opposes homosexuality and other immorality
 - c. But willing to depart?
- V. The PCUS: The “Southern Mainline”
- A. From the Civil War to World War II
 1. Initially very conservative, dominated by Old School theology (e.g., R. L. Dabney); also needed 3/4 vote of presbyteries to change *Book of Order*
 2. Very missions oriented
 3. Battle in 1880s over James Woodrow of Columbia Seminary for (more or less) theistic evolution—he was eventually ousted
 4. No Fundamentalist-Modernist controversy: As in the SBC, there *were* liberals but numbers were small and they weren't as radical
 - B. Shifts
 1. Began to change after World War II as South changed (isolation, parochialism diminished—homogenization of culture): Formation of “New South”
 2. “Social activism” a cause of tension—the civil rights movement (segregated presbyteries a heated issue) & women ministers (first woman ordained in 1965)
 3. As with PCUSA, it was leadership pressing ahead of grass roots
 - C. “Continuing Church Movement”
 1. Sought to propagate “old” Southern Presbyterian Church
 2. Sparked by acquittal of Ernest Trice Thompson for heresy in 1950s. Trice was a church historian who described 20th century in the Southern Presbyterian Church as “Out of the Backwaters” and “Into the Mainstream.”
 3. Among leaders L. Nelson Bell (missionary to China & father-in-law to Billy Graham), who opposed leaving the denomination
 4. One expression: Morton Smith & Reformed Theological Seminary Jackson, MS, in 1960s
 5. Eventually became core of many who left to form the PCA

American Presbyterians Outside the Mainline Since the 1930s

I. Presbyterian Church in Canada

A. Background

1. Canada obviously has strong British, including Scottish roots (e.g., *Nova Scotia* means “New Scotland”)
2. Sources of Canadian Presbyterianism
 - a. Various Scottish churches, including the Church of Scotland, organized congregations and later presbyteries; various dissenting churches had strong presence (Seceder, Free Church)
 - b. Others, including some American Presbyterians, planted works, and there was Huguenot influence as well
3. By 1867 Canadian Presbyterians had organized into four main bodies (two with Church of Scotland ties, two with Free Church ties)

4. 1875: All united to form the Presbyterian Church in Canada
- B. History Since 1925
1. Under influence of ecumenical movement, Canada's Methodists, Congregationalists, and the majority of Presbyterians formed the United Church of Canada in 1925
 2. About a third of the Presbyterians resisted the merger and formed a "continuing" Presbyterian Church, winning the name Presbyterian Church in Canada legally in 1939
 3. Numbers are slowly declining—but not so drastically as in the United Church of Canada
 4. Born of different motives: Preserving Presbyterian heritage, theological concern (e.g., Jonathan Goforth—although he joined Presbyterian Church of Manchuria); even a handful of liberals who thought the United Church too conservative
 5. Marked also by a growth of liberalism throughout history
 - a. Member of the WCC and Canadian Council of Churches
 - b. Has not only women clergy (as of 1966) but even women moderators (eliminating scruples over this issue in 1982)
 6. Contains evangelical elements
 - a. "Puritan" fellowship: The Renewal Fellowship Within the Presbyterian Church in Canada
 - b. Influential Knox Presbyterian Church in Toronto
 - c. A few have actually affiliated with the PCA
 7. Case of W. Stanford Reid
 - a. Renowned Canadian Presbyterian historian (e.g., biography of John Knox), but a graduate of Westminster (not an "approved" school)
 - b. Pastor in Montreal & professor at McGill & later University of Guelph, despite harassment of presbytery
 - c. Reid often turned down for positions in denominational schools, but also considered for the presidency of Westminster in 1960s—where questioned for his association with a church in WCC.
 - d. Other evangelicals such as Marcellus Kik left, but Reid remained
- II. Presbyterian Church in America (PCA)
- A. History
1. Formed in 1973; initially concentrated in Mississippi, Alabama, & SC
 2. Derived from old Presbyterian Church in the US (PCUS) or "Southern Presbyterian Church"
 - a. Originally took name "National Presbyterian Church" but changed in 1974
 - b. Part of a "conscience clause" the PCUS adopted as a means of furthering union talks with UPCNA—congregations could leave within a stated period
 3. Merged with Reformed Presbyterian Church—Evangelical Synod in 1982
 - a. The RPCES was merger of a Bible Presbyterian split (Evangelical Presbyterian Church) and an old covenanter group (RPC—General Synod) centered in eastern Ohio and Pennsylvania

- b. Gave PCA its only “official” schools: Covenant College on Lookout Mountain and Covenant Seminary in St. Louis

B. Character

1. Often said to represent the Machen/Princeton/classic Southern Presbyterian theology (seen particularly in the Deep South)
2. Basically conservative, much more so than PCUSA
3. Contains strong confessional elements (e.g., Greenville Presbyterian Theological Seminary)
4. Has moved out of South (although still dominantly southern)—Second biggest Presbyterian church in nation, but far behind the PCUSA
5. “Separatist” in a sense but not militantly so

C. Problems

1. Covenant College—choir participation in Catholic Mass
2. Six-day creation—an “open” question
3. Accusations of Charismatic influence & sympathy toward ordination of women
4. Much like Southern Baptists—a lot of conservative individuals but uncertainty of the overall direction of the denomination

III. Orthodox Presbyterian Church (OPC)

A. History

1. Group formed by J. Gresham Machen in 1936: Machen saw it as a true Presbyterian church under Westminster discipline
2. Significant split with Bible Presbyterians over premillennialism and Christian liberty
 - a. “Christian liberty” in alcohol, tobacco
 - b. An amillennial church that allows premillennial dissent
3. Westminster Seminary seen as “their” school—Cornelius Van Til as representative
4. Memberships
 - a. Rejected NAE in 1943 because of (1) weak confessional basis and (2) violation of church order (mission work should be church-based)
 - b. Withdrew in 1988 from Reformed Ecumenical Synod because of liberalism of some members
 - c. Joined in 1975 North American Presbyterian and Reformed Council

B. Character

1. Considered doctrinally rigorous
2. Confessional
 - a. Unremitting Reformed identity
 - b. Stress on church & sacraments—God’s work essentially through church channels
 - c. Tend toward less stress on evangelical conversion and piety and more on sacramental ministry

C. Controversies

1. Controversies at Westminster & in synod over views of Norman Shepherd who is alleged to teach a view of justification incorporating good works.
2. Smaller incidents often on a local level (e.g., participation of congregations in Promise Keepers—which is not even good Presbyterian identity)

IV. Evangelical Presbyterian Church

A. History

1. Growing Presbyterian body founded in 1981
2. Began as a conservative alternative to PCUSA
3. Spark: Admission of a United Church of Christ minister in 1980 who would not confess that Jesus is the Son of God
4. Like PCA, benefited from an “escape clause” (1983-91) after PCUSA merger

B. Broadly “Evangelical” more than historically “Presbyterian”

1. “Freedom” Issues
 - a. Open to Charismatic influence (congregational choice)
 - b. Allows women ministers, although again allowing congregational liberty; opposes *requiring* ordination of women
2. Allows “scruples” on “non-essential” points (judged by sessions & presbyteries) but insist on commitment to Westminster “system of doctrine”
 - a. Adopted an “Essentials of the Faith”: Seven basic points + an affirmation of the Bible—nothing specifically Reformed in it
 - b. Some of original members described as “less-than-thorough Calvinists”
3. Illustrates a mixture united only by opposition to liberalism

V. Associate Reformed Presbyterian Church (ARP)

A. History

1. Roots in Scottish secessions; stayed out of 19th-century reunions
2. Has been predominantly southern—headquarters in Greenville, SC

B. Character

1. Generally conservative theologically
2. Main school: Erskine College & Seminary—tightened up seminary after questions on inerrancy, etc. in 1970s, 1980s
3. Allows women deacons (though still a debated issue)
4. Questions; Some circles open to contemporary worship, cooperation with compromised efforts

VI. Bible Presbyterian Church (BPC)

A. History

1. Founded by Carl McIntire and J. Oliver Buswell from OPC in 1930s
2. Has had a rocky history of splits
 - a. McIntire accused of “rule or ruin” mentality
 - b. Often seen as experiencing tension between “Presbyterian” and “Fundamentalist”
 - c. Evangelical Presbyterian Church formed 1956 (later Reformed Presbyterian Church, Evangelical Synod, in 1965 that merged with PCA in 1983): Split over presbyterial control vs. McIntire control, as well as political involvement
 - d. Split into two “BPCs” in 1984; healed after McIntire’s death
3. Currently seems to be moving in a good direction, healing old wounds

B. Character

1. With Free Presbyterian Church of North America, the only other Presbyterian denomination that calls itself “Fundamentalist”
2. Has moved from early dispensationalist emphasis

3. In contrast to OPC, BPC is a premillennial church allowing amillennial liberty
4. Currently debating fraternal relations with OPC
5. Organizations: Independent Board for Presbyterian Foreign Missions (IBPFM), Presbyterian Missionary Union (PMU), Western Reformed Theological Seminary (Tacoma, WA)

VII. Free Presbyterian Church of North America

A. History

1. Originally a mission work of the Free Presbyterian Church of Ulster
2. Became an independent presbytery in May 2005
3. Some 25-30 congregations—major congregations in Toronto and in Greenville, SC
4. Organs: *Let the Bible Speak* radio program and magazine; Geneva Reformed Theological Seminary (Greenville, SC)

B. Character

1. Open on baptism—individual liberty over mode and subjects
2. Open on eschatology—Requires only a belief in the Second Coming
3. Use of Authorized Version in public services
4. Belief in head coverings for women in services

VIII. Contemporary Reformed Controversies

A. Christian Reconstruction (Theonomy)

1. Nature
 - a. Conservative Reformed system associated with Rousas Rushdoony (1916-2001)
 - b. Characterized by stress on lasting relevance of the O.T. law with the ultimate imposing of its system on the earth
 - c. Very influential in 1970s and 1980s, esp. in Christian school/home school movements
 - d. Other leaders: Greg Bahnsen (best theologian), Gary North
2. Points of tension
 - a. Specific postmillennialism: Belief in imposing of Mosaic system
 - b. Stress on law, notably sanctification by law
 - c. Accusations of arrogance
3. Roiled PCA and OPC, e.g., but perhaps a fragmenting movement since the death of Rushdoony

B. Westminster Seminary Controversies

1. Norm Shepherd and Justification
 - a. A professor of systematic theology at Westminster in the 1960s and 1970s
 - b. Criticized for teaching a view of justification that mixes faith and works
 - 1) Concepts such as salvation by “obedient faith” (Critic Van Drunen: “By faith we are justified; by obedience we are not.”)
 - 2) Emerges as a kind of justification by faithfulness
 - c. Dismissed in 1981
2. Peter Enns and Inspiration
 - a. Professor of O.T. at Westminster who roused controversy with his book *Inspiration and Incarnation* (2005)
 - b. Dismissed by the board in 2008 despite support by a majority of the faculty

- c. Enns describes Scripture as both divine and human
 - 1) Relies on a faulty incarnational argument—Just a Christ is both human and divine, so is Scripture
 - a) Effect is that Bible is subject to historical criticism that calls into question the accuracy of Scripture
 - b) Warfield faulted similar arguments years ago as faulty and imprecise—the hypostatic union of Christ is not exactly parallel to the Scripture’s divine and human components (noted by investigating committee at Westminster)
 - c) Would not this argument (the Bible is human and therefore limited) imply that Christ as both man and God must be sinful to be genuinely human?
 - 2) Ends up denying divine authorship: According to the investigating Westminster committee, in Enns’ position the Bible not “*foundationally* and *essentially* divine” [italics in original]
 - d. Relies on but abuses the Reformed idea of “accommodation,” that God accommodates His message to the understanding of humans
- C. Federal Vision (Auburn Avenue Theology)
 - 1. Nature of the Position
 - a. An attempt to renew modern Reformed theology in a manner allegedly more consistent with Reformation and biblical teaching
 - b. Sometimes called Auburn Avenue Theology after a meeting promoting this teaching at the Auburn Avenue Presbyterian Church in Louisiana (PCA) in 2002
 - c. Name derives from idea that God has a covenant involving all professed Christianity as God’s family as well as with the elect who are truly saved (e.g., as Israel was corporately in the covenant)
 - d. Claims Van Til’s presuppositionalism, Christian Reconstruction, and the Dutch School (Neo-Calvinism) of Abraham Kuyper as major influences
 - e. Strongly postmillennial but not Reconstructionist
 - 2. Points of Controversy
 - a. Baptism
 - 1) Hold a form of baptismal regeneration, although see *regeneration* more in the general Reformation sense of “salvation,” but still seeing baptism as conveying salvific blessing
 - 2) Refer to nominal Christians of any kind as “Christian” if they are baptized
 - b. Infant Communion
 - 1) Argue that covenant children should receive the Lord’s Supper
 - 2) Critics ask, Does this make the Lord’s Supper a converting ordinance? Is there no “fence” about the communion table?
 - c. Deny imputation of Christ’s active obedience to the believer
 - d. Accused of sympathy with “New Perspective on Paul” (N. T. Wright)
 - 1) NPP redefines justification more as a means of equal entrance to the covenant than of individual salvation
 - 2) Supporters say just similarity on some points (e.g., that Judaism was never a religion of works)

3. Evaluation
 - a. Definitely more from the confessional than the evangelical perspective with stress on church order, sacraments, and catechism
 - b. Appears to reflect charge often made against Kuyper of “presumptive regeneration” (those baptized and catechized are assumed to be regenerate in absence of contrary evidence)
4. Teaching investigated and criticized by PCA and OPC

Annotated Bibliography

- Allison, L. M. *A Short History of the Associate Reformed Presbyterian Church, Its Agencies, and Institutions*. Greenville, SC: Board of Christian Education, 1984.
- Armstrong, Maurice W., et al., ed. *The Presbyterian Enterprise: Sources of American Presbyterian History*. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1956. A full and valuable collection of primary sources.
- Balmer, Randall, and John R. Fitzmier, *The Presbyterians*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1993. A brief history combined with a biographical dictionary; helpful.
- Barkley, John M. *A Short History of the Presbyterian Church in Ireland*. Belfast: Presbyterian Church in Ireland, [1959]. Compact survey.
- Beale, David O. *In Pursuit of Purity: American Fundamentalism Since 1850*. Greenville, S.C.: Unusual Publications, 1986. Devotes considerable space to the Fundamentalist controversy among Presbyterians and its background as well as details on Fundamentalist Presbyterian groups (e.g., Bible Presbyterians and Free Presbyterians).
- Briggs, Charles Augustus. *American Presbyterianism: Its Origin and Early History*. New York: Charles Scribner’s Sons, 1885. By a notorious Presbyterian liberal but a thorough study from European beginnings through the colonial era; contains appendices with over thirty significant documents and sources.
- Brown, John. *A Compendius History of the Church of Scotland*. Glasgow: John Boyce, 1784. Account by John Brown of Haddington, famous Scottish minister and commentator.
- Bruce, Steve. *God Save Ulster! The Religion and Politics of Paisleyism*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1986. One of the standard scholarly studies of Ian Paisley, though superseded by Bruce’s biography of Paisley (q.v.).
- . *Paisley: Religion and Politics in Northern Ireland*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007. Fairly objective study of Paisley published just before he became First Minister of Northern Ireland.
- Buchanan, Robert. *The Ten Year’s Conflict: Being the History of the Disruption of the Church of Scotland*. 2 vols. Glasgow: Blackie and Son, 1849. Contemporary account of the Disruption from the Free Church perspective.
- Burleigh, J. H. S. *A Church History of Scotland*. London: Oxford University Press, 1960. The standard work.

- Calhoun, David. *Princeton Seminary*. 2 vols. Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 1994, 1996. Sympathetic study of the Princeton's orthodox years.
- Carson, John L., and David W. Hall, ed. *The Glorify and Enjoy God: A Commemoration of the 350th Anniversary of the Westminster Assembly*. Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 1994. Historical and theological essays.
- The Centennial History of the Associate Reformed Presbyterian Church 1803-1903*. Charleston, SC: Walker, Evans, and Cogswell, 1905.
- Churchill, Robert King. *Lest We Forget: A Personal Reflection on the Formation of the Orthodox Presbyterian Church*. Philadelphia: Committee for the Historian of the Orthodox Presbyterian Church, [1986].
- Clark, Gordon. *What Presbyterians Believe: The Westminster Confession Yesterday and Today*. Rev. ed. Nutley, NJ: Presbyterian and Reformed Publishing Company, 1977. A commentary on the Westminster Confession of Faith.
- Collins, G. N. M. *The Heritage of Our Fathers, The Free Church of Scotland: Her Origin and Testimony*. 2nd ed. Edinburgh: Knox Press, 1976. Argues that the Free Church is the continuation of the true heritage of the Church of Scotland.
- Cowan, Ian B. *The Scottish Reformation: Church and Society in Sixteenth Century Scotland*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1982.
- Dennison, Charles G., and Richard C. Gamble. *Pressing Toward the Mark: Essays Commemorating Fifty Years of the Orthodox Presbyterian Church*. Philadelphia: Committee for the Historian of the Orthodox Presbyterian Church, 1986. An excellent collection of articles historical and theological which, despite the title, deal with Presbyterianism in general as well as the OPC.
- Donaldson, Gordon. *Scotland: Church and Nation Through Sixteen Centuries*. New York: Barnes and Noble, 1972.
- . *The Scottish Reformation*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1960.
- Douglas, J. D. *Light in the North: The Story of the Scottish Covenanters*. Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 1964. A readable, evangelical history.
- Elliott, Paul M. *Christianity and Neo-Liberalism: The Spiritual Crisis in the Orthodox Presbyterian Church and Beyond*. Unicoi, TN: Trinity Foundation, 2005. A fierce critique of trends within the OPC from a strongly conservative Reformed position.
- Farmer, James Oscar. *The Metaphysical Confederacy: James Henley Thornwell and the Synthesis of Southern Values*. Macon, GA: Mercer University Press, 1986. Influential study of a major Southern Presbyterian figure.
- Fortson, S. Donald, III., ed. *Colonial Presbyterianism: Old Faith in a New Land*. Eugene, OR: Pickwick Publications, 2007. Collection of helpful articles, although of uneven quality.
- Gross, Alexander, et al. *A History of the Methodist Church, South, the United Presbyterian Church, the Cumberland Presbyterian Church, and the Presbyterian*

- Church, South, in the United States*. New York: Christian Literature Company, 1894. An old classic in the American Church History series.
- Hamilton, Thomas. *History of the Irish Presbyterian Church*. Special edition. Edinburgh: T & T Clark, [1887]. Older, brief survey.
- Hart, D. G. *Defending the Faith: J. Gresham Machen and the Crisis of Conservative Protestantism in Modern America*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1994. Major interpretative study of Machen's thought and life. Cf. Stonehouse's biography.
- , ed. *Dictionary of the Presbyterian and Reformed Tradition in America*. Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 1999. An excellent, compact, and succinct resource.
- , and John R. Meuther, *Fighting the Good Fight: A Brief History of the Orthodox Presbyterian Church*. Philadelphia: Committee on Christian education and the Historian of the Orthodox Presbyterian Church, 1995.
- , and John R. Meuther, *Seeking a Better Country: 300 Years of American Presbyterianism*. Phillipsburg, NJ: P & R Publishing, 2006. A conservative survey, primarily of groups rooted in the founding the first American presbytery in 1706. Probably the best survey of Presbyterian history.
- Hatch, Carl E. *The Charles A. Briggs Heresy Trial*. New York: Exposition Press, 1969.
- Henderson, Henry F. *Religion in Scotland: Its Influence on National Life and Character*. Paisley: Alexander Gardner, [1920]. On the effect of religion on Scotland—its government, society, culture, etc.
- . *The Religious Controversies of Scotland*. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, 1905. Studies in the smaller controversies in Scottish history (Marrow controversy, over David Hume, Edward Irving, higher criticism, etc.).
- Hetherington, W. M. *History of the Church of Scotland*. New York: Robert Clark and Brothers, 1881. Older, thorough history.
- Hodge, A. A. *The Confession of Faith*. 1869. Reprint. Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 1978. Classic commentary on the Westminster Confession of Faith.
- Hodge, Charles. *The Constitutional History of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America*. 2 vols. Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, 1851. A history by a leading Old School theologian stressing the constitutional development of the Presbyterian church from 1705 to 1788.
- Holmes, Finlay. *Our Irish Presbyterian Heritage* (Belfast: Presbyterian Church in Ireland, 1985. Probably the best survey of Irish Presbyterianism, superseding Hamilton (q.v.).
- Howie, John. *Lives of the Scottish Covenanters*. 1858. Reprint. Greenville, SC: A Press, 1981. A series of biographical studies.
- Hutchinson, George P. *The History Behind the Reformed Presbyterian Church, Evangelical Synod*. Cherry Hill, NJ: Mack Publishing Company, 1974. Actually an overall history of American Presbyterianism to justify the RPCES; provides discussion of the mainline, the Bible Presbyterian Church, etc.

- Johnson, Gary L. W., ed. *B. B. Warfield: Essays on His Life and Thought*. Phillipsburg, NJ: P&R Publishing, 2007.
- Kelly, Douglas. *Preachers with Power: Four Stalwarts of the South*. Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 1992. Studies of Southern Presbyterian ministers/theologians Daniel Baker, James Henley Thornwell, Benjamin Morgan Palmer, and John L. Girardeau.
- Klett, Guy S. *Minutes of the Presbyterian Church in America 1706-1788*. Philadelphia: Presbyterian Historical Society, 1976.
- Knox, John. *The Reformation in Scotland*. Ed. C. J. Guthrie. 1898. Reprint. Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 1982. Abridged version of Knox's classic history.
- . *John Knox's History of the Reformation in Scotland*. Ed. William Croft Dickinson. 2 vols. New York: Philosophical Library, 1950. Standard edition of Knox's history; see also Guthrie's abridged version above.
- Robert Latham. *History of the Associate Reformed Synod of the South*. Harrisonburg, PA: Published by the author, 1882. Gives the background of the ARP.
- Livingstone, David N., and Ronald A. Wells, *Ulster-American Religion: Episodes in the History of a Cultural Connection*. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1999. Good discussion of Ulster-American parallels among Presbyterians in the late 19th and 20th century, notably the trans-Atlantic career of W. P. Nicholson.
- Loetscher, Lefferts A. *A Brief History of the Presbyterians*. 4th ed. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1978. A standard survey from the liberal point of view.
- . *The Broadening Church*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1954. Famous study of changes within the northern Presbyterian church, not only the controversy over Modernism but also the moving of the church into the mainstream of cultural life with less emphasis on traditional Presbyterianism.
- Longfield, Bradley J. *The Presbyterian Controversy: Fundamentalists, Modernists, and Moderates*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1991. Perhaps the best study of the Fundamentalist-Modernist controversy in the Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A.
- Lucas, Sean Michael. *Robert Lewis Dabney: A Southern Presbyterian Life*. Phillipsburg, NJ: P&R Publishing, 2005.
- Mackay, John A. *The Presbyterian Way of Life*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall, 1960. Autobiographical notes by a president of Princeton Seminary and leading advocate of Neo-Orthodoxy within the PCUSA; reflects his Neo-Orthodox orientation.
- Marsden, George M. *The Evangelical Mind and the New School Presbyterian Experience*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1970. Deeply influential study that stresses the New School not as a forerunner of later liberalism but of many forms of evangelicalism and Fundamentalism. Marsden has articles summarizing this research in the anthology edited by Dennison and Gamble (q.v.).
- McCook, John J., ed. *The Appeal in the Briggs Heresy Case*. New York: John C. Rankin, 1893. Documents compiled by one of the prosecutors against Briggs.

- McCrie, Thomas. *Life of Andrew Melville*. Edinburgh: William Blackwood, 1824. Classic biography.
- . *Life of John Knox*. Philadelphia: Presbyterian Board of Publication, [1831]. A classic biography superseded to an extent by Percy and Reid (q.v.).
- McDonnold, B. W. *History of the Cumberland Presbyterian Church*. Nashville: Board of Publication of Cumberland Presbyterian Church, 1899.
- McIntire, Carl. *The Death of a Church*. Collingswood, NJ: Christian Beacon Press, 1967. Fundamentalist critique of the 1967 Confession.
- McLeod, John. *Scottish Theology in Relation to Church History Since the Reformation*. Edinburgh: Publications Committee of the Free Church of Scotland, 1943. Well-regarded lectures by a leading Free Church theologian originally delivered at Westminster Seminary in 1939.
- McPherson, A., ed. *History of the Free Presbyterian Church of Scotland (1893-1970)*. Inverness: Publications Committee of the Free Presbyterian Church of Scotland, [1982?].
- Miller, Park Hays. *Why I Am a Presbyterian*. New York: Thomas Nelson and sons, 1956. Although dated and from a liberal, mainline point of view, explains some of the basics of Presbyterian practice and heritage.
- Muir, Pearson M' Adam. *The Church of Scotland: A Sketch of Its History*. Edinburgh: Clark, [1897].
- Murray, Andrew E. *Presbyterians and the Negro—A History*. Philadelphia: Presbyterian Historical Society, 1966.
- Murray, Iain H. *A Scottish Christian Heritage*. Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 2006. Diverse sketches of Scottish church history by a noted conservative British evangelical historian.
- Noll, Mark. *The Princeton Theology 1812-1921*. Grand Rapids: Baker, 1983. A helpful essay by Noll followed by selections from the major Princeton theologians.
- Percy, Lord Eustace. *John Knox*. Richmond: John Knox Press, 1937. Considered the modern replacement for McCrie's biography (q.v.), now somewhat dated.
- Posey, Walter Brownlaw. *The Presbyterian Church in the Old Southwest 1778-1838*. Richmond, VA: John Knox Press, 1952.
- The Presbyterian Presence: The Twentieth-Century Experience series. Milton J. Coalter, et al., ed. Louisville: Westminster/John Knox Press. Studies in the history, nature, and prospects of the Presbyterian church, primarily from a mainline points of view. Individual volumes: *The Re-forming Tradition: Presbyterians and Mainstream Protestantism* (1990); *The Confessional Mosaic: Presbyterians and Twentieth-Century Theology* (1990); *The Organizational Revolution: Presbyterians and American Denominationalism* (1992); *The Mainstream Protestant "Decline": The Presbyterian Pattern* (1990); *The Presbyterian Predicament: Six Perspectives* (1990); *The Pluralistic Vision: Presbyterians and Mainstream Protestant Education and Leadership* (1992).

- Purves, Jock. *Sweet Believing: Eight Character Studies of the Scottish Covenanters*. Stirling, Scotland: Stirling Tract Enterprise, n.d. Devotional studies.
- Reid, W. Stanford. *Trumpeter of God: A Biography of John Knox*. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1974. Solid biography by a conservative Presbyterian church historian.
- Renwick, A. M. *The Story of the Scottish Reformation*. Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 1960. Compact, helpful survey.
- Rian, Edward H. *The Presbyterian Conflict*. Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 1940. An older but classic account of the Fundamentalist-Modernist controversy within the northern Presbyterian church from the OPC point of view.
- Robe, James. *When the Wind Blows*. Glasgow: Ambassador, 1985. Reprint of 18th century firsthand account of the Kilsyth and Cambuslang revivals.
- Separated Unto the Gospel: The Mission and Work of the Free Presbyterian Church*. Newtown Square, PA: Free Presbyterian Church of North America, 1991. Summary of the history and beliefs of the FPC including its Articles of Faith.
- The Sesquicentennial History of Associate Reformed Presbyterian Church: Mainly Covering the Period 1903-1951*. Clinton, SC: Jacobs Brothers, 1951. Supplements *The Centennial History of the Associate Reformed Presbyterian Church 1803-1903* (q.v.).
- Smellie, Alexander. *Men of the Covenant*. 1903. Reprint. Edinburgh: Banner of Truth, 1962. Classic account of the Covenanters and their era.
- Smith, Frank Joseph. *The History of the Presbyterian Church in America*. Silver Anniversary Edition. Lawrenceville, GA: Presbyterian Scholars Press, 1999. A thorough, official denominational history.
- Smith, Morton H. *Commentary on the Book of Church Order*. Greenville, SC: Greenville Seminary Press, 1990. Authoritative explanation of the PCA's *Book of Church Order* by one of the founding fathers of the PCA.
- . *How Is the Gold Become Dim: The Decline of the Presbyterian Church, U.S., as Reflected in Its Assembly Actions*. Greenville, SC: Southern Presbyterian Press, 1973.
- . *Studies in Southern Presbyterian Theology*. Jackson, MS: Presbyterian Reformation Society, 1962. Smith's dissertation, a survey of Southern Presbyterian theologians to the end of the 19th century.
- Smylie, James H. *American Presbyterians: A Pictorial History*. Philadelphia: Presbyterian Historical Society, 1985. A popular survey from the mainline point of view.
- Spottiswood, John. *History of the Church of Scotland*. 3 vols. Reprint. New York: AMS Press, 1973. Early 17th century account.
- Sproul, R. C. *Truths We Confess: A Layman's Guide to the Westminster Confession of Faith*. 3 vols. Phillipsburg, NJ: P&R Publishing, 2006, 2007.
- Stalker, James. *John Knox: His Ideas and Ideals*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1904. A brief biography with discussion of Knox's theological and political ideas; very accessible.

- Stewart, Alexander, and J. Kennedy Cameron. *The Free Church of Scotland: The Crisis of 1900*. Edinburgh: Knox Press, 1910. Defends the minority view against reunion with the Church of Scotland.
- Stonehouse, Ned. *J. Gresham Machen: A Biographical Memoir*. Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 1955. Standard account by a friend of Machen's; see also Hart's *Defending the Faith*.
- Sweet, William Warren. *The Presbyterians*. Vol. 2 in *Religion on the American Frontier 1783-1840*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1936. A brief survey with a full selection of original documents from the colonial/early American era.
- Thompson, Ernest Trice. *Presbyterians in the South*. 3 vols. Richmond: John Knox Press, 1963-73. Large and authoritative survey by a leading "progressive" historian of the PCUS
- Thompson, Robert Ellis. *A History of the Presbyterian Churches in the United States*. New York: Christian Literature Company, 1895. A standard, if dated, survey from the American Church History series.
- Trinterud, Leonard J. *The Forming of an American Tradition: A Re-examination of Colonial Presbyterianism*. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1949. A well-regarded, if dated, study.
- Vander Velde, Lewis G. *The Presbyterian Churches and the Federal Union 1861-1869*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1932. Full, older account of the topic.
- Van Til, Cornelius. *The Confession of 1967: Its Theological Background and Ecumenical Significance*. Philadelphia: Presbyterian and Reformed Publishing Company, 1967. A Conservative critique of the 1967 Confession.
- Walker, Norman L. *Scottish Church History*. Edinburgh: T&T Clark, n.d. A handbook for laymen.
- Ware, Lowry, and James W. Gettys. *The Second Century: A History of the Associated Reformed Presbyterians 1882-1982*. Greenville, SC: Associate Reformed Presbyterian Center, [1982].
- Warfield, Benjamin B. *The Westminster Assembly and Its Work*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1931. Studies in history and theology.
- Watt, Hugh. *Thomas Chalmers and the Disruption*. Edinburgh: Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1943. Lectures on a key event in Scottish church history.
- Wells, David, ed. *The Princeton Theology*. Grand Rapids: Baker, 1989. Both this and the following a slender collections of excellent essays.
- , ed. *Southern Reformed Theology*. Grand Rapids: Baker, 1989. See above.
- Weston, William J. *Presbyterian Pluralism: Competition in a Protestant House*. Knoxville: University of Tennessee Press, 1997. Study of the Fundamentalist controversy with Presbyterianism focusing on the key role played moderates between the Fundamentalist and Modernist ends of the spectrum.

- White, Henry Alexander. *Southern Presbyterian Leaders, 1683-1911*. 1911. Reprint. Edinburgh: Banner of Truth Trust, 2000. Reprint of a biographical guide to major leaders.
- Woodrow, Robert. *The History of the Sufferings of the Church of Scotland*. 4 vols. 1837. Reprint. Birmingham, AL: Solid Ground Christian Books, 2008. Full account of the suffering of the Covenanters during the “Killing Time.”
- Worthen, Molly. “The Chalcedon Problem: Rousas John Rushdoony and the Origins of Christian Reconstruction.” *Church History* 77 (June 2008): 399-437. Full and perceptive article on Rushdoony and Christian Reconstruction (Theonomy).
- Zenos, Andrew C. *Presbyterianism in America: Past—Present and Prospective*. New York: Thomas Nelson and Sons, 1937. Well-regarded, compact survey by a noted liberal church historian.